Procedure

This year’s Ethics Bowl round structure will be formatted differently to better align with the program’s goals and to be developmentally and age appropriate. Only one case will be discussed during each round. Both teams will present on the same case and respond to the same question. Then they will engage in an open dialogue with one another. Teams will know the cases and case questions in advance, and will also be expected to answer judges’ questions near the end of the round. During the “final question” portion of the round, which is new, each team will be asked to reflect on and share what they learned from discussing the case with one another.

Round Structure: (45 minutes)

1. Conferral Time (2 minutes)
2. Team A Presents (3 minutes)
3. Team B Presents (3 minutes)
4. Open Dialogue (10 minutes with Team A starting)
5. Conferral Time (3 minutes)
6. Judges’ Questions to Team A & Team B (12 minutes)
7. Conferral Time (1 minute)
8. Final Question for Team A & Team B (1 minute each with Team B starting)
9. Scoring Time (5 minutes)
   a. teams will leave the room during this period and wait outside the room until called back in by the moderator
10. Winner Announcement (1 minute)

Total maximum score: 40 points
Scoring

All presentation, open dialogue, and judges’ questions will be scored using the same ten point scale:

- 9-10 = Excellent
- 7-8 = Very Good
- 5-6 = Good
- 5-8 = Fair
- 1-4 = Needs improvement

The Final Question and Respectful Dialogue which will be scored on a 1-5 scale:

- 5 = Excellent
- 4 = Very Good
- 3 = Good
- 2 = Fair
- 1 = Needs improvement

Note to Judges: Do not confer with each other about your scores. Strive to be consistent in how you interpret these scoring categories within and across rounds. At the end of each round, you will “vote” for the team you gave the most points to in a round. If you give the same number of points to both teams, then the vote is split in half (i.e. ½ vote to Team A and ½ vote to Team B).
Presentation (10 points)

- Did the team clearly and systematically identify and thoroughly discuss the case’s central ethical dimensions?

- Was the team aware of and considering different viewpoints, including those most likely to be cited by those who disagree with the team’s position?

  **Guidelines for Coaches**
  - Team B does not need to adjust its presentation to react to Team A’s presentation; Team B is not responding to Team during this portion of the round but rather giving the presentation they have prepared in advance.

  **Guidelines for Judges**
  - Since teams can prepare these remarks in advance, it is likely that two teams will present similar ideas. Do not penalize Team B for this. The students are not responding to Team A’s presentation, but rather giving a “standalone” presentation of their own.

Open Dialogue (10 points)

- Did the team directly and critically answer questions posed by the other team, and propose original ideas?

- Did the team build on the ideas of others, so as to meaningfully explore different ethical perspectives and positions relevant to the case question?

- Did the team focus on ethical concepts during the dialogue?

  **Guidelines for Coaches & Judges:** This portion of the round emphasizes active listening and awareness of ethical implications. Listen for contributions that:
  - Give relevant examples
  - Articulate complex ideas in a clear way
  - Ask questions that move the discussion forward
J udges Questions (10 points)

- Were the team’s responses thoughtfully composed and well developed?
- Did the team directly address the judges’ questions?
- Did the responses indicate an awareness of the core ethical issues within each question?

Guidelines for Coaches:
- Teams should not take up “air time” to run out the clock. Each w s wow w ww team should have equal airtime during this portion of the round.

Guidelines for Judges
- Ideally, this segment will build on the open dialogue. Here are strategies for asking questions:
  - Alternate questions between teams so that teams get equal airtime
  - Ask both teams to respond to each question
  - Keep your question under a minute
  - You don’t need to ask a question

Guidelines for Moderators: At the start of this portion of the round, make it clear that:
- The two teams should get equal airtime during this segment.
- Judges or team members who go on for too long will be interrupted
  - Establish the signal you will use to indicate time is up - perhaps a knock on your desk - after which the speaker will finish the sentence and then yield the floor.
- Judges’ questions should not take longer than 45 seconds to ask.
SCORE SHEET – MIDDLE SCHOOL ETHICS BOWL 2022

Final Question (5 points)

- How has your team’s position developed during this round? Identify a point raised by the other team that made you think differently about the case.

- Guidelines for Coaches:
  - If your team does not change its initial position, members should be able to talk about how the other team broadened and/or deepened their understanding of the case. That is, your team now understands that the case is more complex, that there are other perspectives they hadn’t considered, or that they now have additional reasons to support their initial position.

- Guidelines for Judges:
  - Each team should identify one useful contribution the other team made and explain why it was useful. A laundry list of items should not receive full points.

Respectful Dialogue (5 points)

- Did the team exemplify the spirit of the ethics bowl by demonstrating open-mindedness, taking turns, listening actively, and maintaining civility especially when disagreements arose?

- Guidelines for Coaches:
  - Encourage your team to:
    - share air time within and across teams
    - be respectful not only in dialogue but in terms of body-language, facial expressions, tone, etc
    - actively participate in all portions of the round, including by demonstrating active listening

- Guidelines for Judges:
  - Demonstrate engagement (verbally and non-verbally) with all portions of the round
  - Maintain impartiality and neutrality at all times
MSEB ROUND SCORE SHEET
please score using only whole numbers

I. PRESENTATION
Team A _____ / 10
Team B ____ / 10

II. OPEN DIALOGUE
Team A ______ / 10
Team B _____ / 10

III. JUDGES QUESTIONS
Team A ______ / 10
Team B _____ / 10

IV. FINAL QUESTION
Team A______ / 5
Team B______ / 5

V. RESPECTFUL DIALOGUE
Team A _____ / 5
Team B ______ / 5

---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Final Score:  Team A _____ / 40
Team B _______ / 40